GARY LOCKE
Governor

STATE OF WASHINGTON

WASHINGTON WORKFIRST

Department of Social and Health Services • PO Box 45000 • Olympia, Washington 98504-5000 • (360) 902-8400
Employment Security Department • PO Box 49046 • Olympia, Washington 98504-9046 • (360) 902-9500
State Board for Community and Technical Colleges • PO Box 42495 • Olympia, Washington 98504-2495 • (360) 753-2000
Department of Community, Trade & Economic Development • PO Box 48300 • Olympia, Washington 98504-8300 • (360) 753-2200

August 2, 2004

TO: The Honorable Joseph Zarelli, Chair, Senate Ways and Means Committee
The Honorable Val Stevens, Chair, Senate Children and Family Services and Corrections Committee
The Honorable Helen Sommers, Chair, House Appropriations Committee
The Honorable Ruth Kagi, Chair, House Children and Family Services Committee

FROM: Ken Miller, Coordinator, WorkFirst Performance Team

SUBJECT: WAGE PROGRESSION AND WORKFIRST RETURNS REPORT

Section 207(1)(a) of ESHB 2459 mandates a quarterly report on performance measures of WorkFirst clients 12, 24, and 36 months after leaving the program. Those measures include:

1) Median percentage increase in earnings and hourly wage;
2) Percentage with earnings above 100 and 200 percent of federal poverty guidelines;
3) A comparison group of similar workers who did not participate in WorkFirst, and
4) The percentage of WorkFirst returns.

If you have comments or questions about the Wage Progression and Returns report, please contact me.

Attachment

cc: Marty Brown

WorkFirst Wage Progression and Returns Report: Through Fourth Quarter 2003

Introduction

Section 207(1)(a) of ESSB 5404 mandates a quarterly report on performance measures of WorkFirst clients 12, 24, and 36 months after leaving the program. These measures are:

1. median percentage increase in earnings and hourly wage;
2. percentage with earnings above 100 and 200 percent of federal poverty guidelines;
3. a comparison group of similar workers who did not participate in WorkFirst, and
4. the percentage of WorkFirst returns.

Statutory Requirement:

Section 207(1)(a) of ESSB 5404 requires the Department of Social and Health Services to do the following:

> Continue to implement WorkFirst program improvements that are designed to achieve progress against outcome measures specified in RCW 74.08A.410. Valid outcome measures of job retention and wage progression shall be developed and reported quarterly to appropriate fiscal and policy committees of the legislature for families who leave assistance, measured after 12 months, 24 months, and 36 months. An increased attention to job retention and wage progression is necessary to emphasize the legislature's goal that the WorkFirst program succeed in helping recipients gain long-term economic independence and not cycle on and off public assistance. The wage progression measure shall report the median percentage increase in quarterly earnings and hourly wage after 12 months, 24 months, and 36 months. The wage progression report shall also report the percent with earnings above one hundred percent and two hundred percent of the federal poverty level. The report shall compare former WorkFirst participants with similar workers who did not participate in WorkFirst. The department shall also report percentage of families who have returned to temporary assistance for needy families after 12 months, 24 months, and 36 months.

Performance Report

WorkFirst Exiters. For all tables in this report, the "exiters" column refers to WorkFirst exiters, and "comparison" refers to the comparison group described below. Exiters are defined as TANF clients who:

- received a TANF grant in July, August, September of the cohort year (for example, for the Q4 2000 cohort, July, August, or September of 2000), and
- did not receive a TANF grant in either October, November, or December.

The exiters columns and the comparison group columns include figures for three different cohorts, from the fourth quarters of 2000, 2001 and 2002. Numbers in the same column therefore may not be compared for quarterly or yearly changes.

For both the exiters and the comparison group, only individuals with earnings reported to the unemployment insurance system (by their employers) are included. Wage and earnings are not available for individuals without reported earnings.

Comparison Group. The ideal comparison group for WorkFirst recipients would be a sample of poor families, identical in all respects to WorkFirst recipients, *except that they did not receive TANF grants*. It is unlikely that such an ideal comparison group of poor families can be clearly identified; WorkFirst clients, viewed as a statistical population, are different from other state residents in many ways not captured by state data. In terms of their labor market characteristics, WorkFirst recipients have less work experience and lower educational attainment than the general state population. WorkFirst recipients also face other difficulties, such as high rates of physical abuse (47%), sexual abuse (32%), and work-limiting physical, emotional or mental conditions (36%). In addition, WorkFirst recipients are overwhelmingly female, and are much less likely to be married than women in the general state population. See *Chartbook*, The WorkFirst Study, 2001 (http://www.wa.gov/WorkFirst/about/WFSChartBook.pdf).

The comparison group for WorkFirst exiters used in this report, while less than ideal, is built upon a reasonable set of assumptions. It is based on the hypothesis that low-wage workers in comparable industry groups are similar in their labor market behavior. Because most WorkFirst clients tend to work in certain industries, the following methods were used to simulate the economic characteristics of WorkFirst exiters:

- From the *WorkFirst Study of 3000 Washington Families (WFS)*, employment industries reported by survey respondents were coded into Standard Industry Code (SIC) classifications, according to *Employment and Payrolls in Washington State by County and Industry* (LMEA, 1999).
- From the Unemployment Insurance employer and wage data (UI data), records were extracted for all individuals in the state who worked in these SIC codes in the target quarters (2000 Q4, 2001 Q4, and 2002 Q4).

- Total earnings for these identified individuals, in the WFS SIC codes and other industries, were pulled from the UI data for the target quarters.
- The bottom 50% of earners in each quarters' data set were selected, as most likely to represent an accurate comparison group for WorkFirst exiters.
- Median wages for WorkFirst exiters and the comparison group were calculated to validate the selections. For both groups, wages above $50/hour and below $5/hour were excluded, as they were likely to represent employers' reporting errors.

Table 1 lists the selected industries from which the comparison group was created. The Standard Industry Code (SIC) is a four digit number. Two digit numbers are used in many cases to indicate a group of SIC codes related to a broader industry group. For example, "08" (forestry) is a broad definition of industries related to forest products. They include "0811" (timber tracts), "0831" (forest products), and "0851" (forest services). For details of all two digit SIC codes in Table 1, see *Employment and Payrolls in Washington State by County and Industry* (LMEA, 1999).

Table 1: SIC codes for selection of the comparison group

SIC code	Description
01-07	Agriculture
08	Forestry
09	Fishing
10-14	Mining
15-17	Construction
20-39	Manufacturing
41-47	transit, transportation, and warehousing
48	Communications
49	electric, gas & sanitary services
50	wholesale trade--durable goods
51	wholesale trade--non-durable goods
52	building materials and garden supply stores
53	general merchandise stores
54	food stores
55	auto dealers and gas stations
56	apparel and accessory stores
57	furniture and home furnishing stores
58	eating and drinking places
59	miscellaneous retail
60-67	finance, insurance, and real estate
70	hotels and other lodging places
72	personal services
73	business services
75	auto repair, services & parking
76	miscellaneous repair
78	motion picture theaters, rental, etc.
79	amusement and recreation services
80	health services

81	legal services
82	educational services
83	social services
84	museums, art galleries, et al.
86	membership organizations
87	engineering, accounting, research, management, et al.
88	private households
91-97	public administration

Mean Hourly Wage Rates. The Employment Security Department (ESD) does not collect workers' hourly wage information. While employers report both quarterly earnings and hours worked to the Unemployment Insurance program, the hours data are incomplete or, in some cases, inaccurate. Hourly wage figures in this update were estimated as described below:

For both WorkFirst exiters and the comparison group, the selection of wage records followed the rules of 1999 *Washington Wage Report* (http://www.wa.gov/esd/lmea/sprepts/wagerpt/wawagrpt.htm). The methodology used in *The Washington Wage Report* was augmented as follows:

- About 10% of the wage records had missing hours. They were deleted from the dataset.
- In the wage record, an 'hours worked' variable exactly equal to 1000 indicates that room and board was received with wages. Since these are not actual hours worked, these records were also excluded from analysis.
- Outliers have been excluded. For both WorkFirst exiters and the comparison group, wages greater than $50/hour or less than $5/hour were excluded, since most of these were due to employers' reporting errors. Tests proved that eliminating these records did not affect the median wage or percentage change in quarterly earnings, although it did affect the means.
- The hourly wage was obtained by dividing quarterly earnings by hours worked in the quarter.

Table 2. Median hourly wages for adult TANF exiters and comparison group

	starting quarter		after 12 months		after 24 months		after 36 months	
cohort	exiters	Comp	exiters	comp	exiters	comp	exiters	comp
2000Q4	$8.00	$9.06	$8.62	$10.01	$9.03	$10.65	$9.36	$11.18
2001Q4	$8.08	$9.36	$8.65	$10.21	$9.03	$10.82	n/a	n/a
2002Q4	$8.24	$9.61	$8.81	$10.38	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a

Median Percentage Increase in Earnings. Wage progression was measured as change in total earnings over one, two or three years. Earnings are a more accurate reflection of true progression than are wages, because they reflect both an individual's wage and any changes between part-and full-time work. Table 3 shows *real,* or inflation-adjusted, median quarterly earnings for exiters and the comparison group. Earnings progressions are expressed cumulatively in Table 4, indicating the

change from the starting year's earnings; in Table 5, non-cumulative changes reflect the progression from the starting year's earnings.

Table 3. Quarterly earnings for adult TANF exiters and comparison group (starting quarter dollars)								
	starting quarter		after 12 months		after 24 months		after 36 months	
cohort	exiters	comparison	exiters	comparison	exiters	comparison	exiters	comparison
2000Q4	$2,491	$2,732	$2,905	$3,593	$3,111	$3,975	$3,325	$4,258
2001Q4	$2,505	$2,751	$2,972	$3,735	$3,203	$4,082	n/a	n/a
2002Q4	$2,516	$2,932	$2,921	$3,841	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a

Table 4. Cumulative change in quarterly earnings (starting quarter dollars)						
	after 12 months		after 24 months		after 36 months	
cohort	exiters	comparison	exiters	comparison	exiters	comparison
2000Q4	17%	32%	25%	45%	33%	56%
2001Q4	19%	36%	28%	48%	n/a	n/a
2002Q4	16%	31%	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a

Table 5. Non-cumulative change in quarterly earnings (starting quarter dollars)						
	after 12 months		after 24 months		after 36 months	
cohort	exiters	comparison	exiters	comparison	exiters	comparison
2000Q4	17%	32%	7%	11%	7%	7%
2001Q4	19%	36%	8%	9%	n/a	n/a
2002Q4	16%	31%	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a

Earnings and the Federal Poverty Guideline. This report uses the WorkFirst assistance unit to estimate family size in determining the federal poverty guidelines for the WorkFirst group. Because family size information for the comparison group is not available, federal poverty guidelines for a family of three is used, according to OFM estimate of the average family size for all housing in the State of Washington (*Developing Trends in Household Size for Use in Population Estimates*, Research Brief No. 10, OFM Population Unit, August 2000).

This performance measure understates the progress of WorkFirst exiters (and the comparison group members) in leaving poverty. For WorkFirst families, as with non-WorkFirst families, one adult's earnings frequently comprise only a portion of the total household income. For example, while 57% of the WorkFirst Study households reported earnings, 42% also reported income from the Earned

Income Tax Credit (equal to up to one-third of annual earnings) and 28% reported income from other sources.

Table 6 and Table 7 examine the WorkFirst exiters and comparison groups' earnings against the federal poverty guidelines. Table 6 measures the earnings against 100% of the federal poverty guidelines; Table 7 measures earnings against 200% of the federal poverty guidelines. For a family of three, the federal poverty guideline is currently $15,260/year.

Table 6. Earnings above 100% of the federal poverty guidelines

	starting quarter		after 12 months		after 24 months		after 36 months	
cohort	exiters	comparison	exiters	comparison	exiters	comparison	exiters	comparison
2000Q4	31.3%	37.1%	41.0%	50.1%	44.7%	55.3%	47.6%	58.9%
2001Q4	29.0%	35.6%	40.3%	50.5%	44.8%	55.6%	n/a	n/a
2002Q4	28.2%	37.0%	38.5%	51.2%	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a

Table 7. Earnings above 200% of the federal poverty guidelines

	starting quarter		after 12 months		after 24 months		after 36 months	
cohort	exiters	comparison	exiters	comparison	exiters	comparison	exiters	comparison
2000Q4	3.7%	0.0%	7.7%	7.3%	9.7%	10.8%	11.9%	14.6%
2001Q4	3.7%	0.0%	7.2%	7.0%	9.6%	11.1%	n/a	n/a
2002Q4	3.1%	0.0%	6.3%	7.1%	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a

WorkFirst Return Rate. Returned clients are defined as a client who received a TANF grant in July, August, or September of the cohort year (2000, 2001, or 2002), did not receive a grant in October, November, or December, and then did receive a grant in the fourth quarter of the following year, two years, or three years later. For example, a client who received a grant in July and August of 2000 and then not again until December 2002 was considered a 24-month returner. Table 8 shows the return rate of exiters in the fourth quarters of 2001, 2002, and 2003; 12, 24 and 36 months after leaving WorkFirst.

Table 8. WorkFirst return rates

cohort	12 months	24 months	36 months
2000Q4	26.38%	12.93%	7.02%
2001Q4	22.62%	10.77%	n/a
2002Q4	23.11%	n/a	n/a